

CITY OF SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS MAYOR'S OFFICE OF STRATEGIC PLANNING & COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT JOSEPH A. CURTATONE MAYOR

GEORGE J. PROAKIS, AICP EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

PLANNING DIVISION

ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS MEMBERS

ORSOLA SUSAN FONTANO, CHAIRMAN DANIELLE EVANS, CLERK ANNE BROCKELMAN ELAINE SEVERINO JOSH SAFDIE DREW KANE, ALTERNATE Case #: ZBA 2019-119 Site: 242 Broadway

Date of Decision: November 20, 2019

Decision: <u>Petition Approved with Conditions</u>

Date Filed with City Clerk: November 26, 2019

ZBA DECISION

Owner Name: Lauro O. DaSilva and Zelia I.C. Silva Owner Address: 77 Munroe Street, Somerville, MA 02143

Applicant Name: Lauro DaSilva

Applicant Address: 77 Munroe Street Somerville, MA 02143

Agent Name: Edward M. Wheeler

Agent Address: P.O Box 410046, Cambridge, MA 02141

<u>Legal Notice:</u> Applicant, Lauro O. DaSilva, and Owners, Lauro O. DaSilva and Zelia I.C. Silva, seek a special permit under SZO §4.4.1 to alter the two nonconforming structures on the lot by constructing rear stairs and dormers. A Special Permit under SZO §7.11 is also required for five residential units and under SZO §9.13 for parking relief.

Zoning District/Ward: RC Zone/Ward 1

Zoning Approval Sought: SP §4.4.1, §7.11, §9.15

Date of Application: October 23, 2019

Date(s) of Public Hearing: November 20, 2019

Date of Decision: November 20, 2019

Vote: 5-0

Appeal #ZBA 2019-119 was opened before the Zoning Board of Appeals at Somerville City Hall on November 20, 2019. Notice of the Public Hearing was given to persons affected and was published and posted, all as required by M.G.L. c. 40A, sec. 11 and the Somerville Zoning Ordinance. On November 19, 2019, the Zoning Board of Appeals took a vote.

<u>DESCRIPTION:</u> The subject property consists of one parcel totaling 3,544 square feet. The site contains two residential structures and a detached four-car carriage house in the rear of the site. The residential structures are located behind one another. Both structures are 2.5 stories with gable ends with the front structure containing three-units and the one behind it being a single-family dwelling.

FINDINGS FOR SPECIAL PERMIT (SZO §4.4.1, §7.11, and §9.13):

In order to grant a special permit, the SPGA must make certain findings and determinations as outlined in §5.1.4 of the SZO. This section of the report goes through §5.1.4 in detail.

1. <u>Information Supplied:</u>

The Board finds that the information provided by the Applicant conforms to the requirements of §5.1.2 of the SZO and allows for a comprehensive analysis of the project with respect to the required Special Permits.

2. <u>Compliance with Standards:</u> The Applicant must comply "with such criteria or standards as may be set forth in this Ordinance which refer to the granting of the requested special permit."

The Board finds compliance with these standards as described below.

Article 4: Nonconforming Uses and Structures

The lot is currently nonconforming with respect to the following dimensional requirements: lot area, landscaped area, permeable area, and street frontage.

Front Structure

The front structure is currently nonconforming with respect to the dimensional requirements for front yard setback and right side yard setback.

Section 4.4.1 states that "[l]awfully existing nonconforming structures other than one- and two-family dwellings may be enlarged, extended, renovated or altered only by special permit authorized by the SPGA in accordance with the procedures of Article 5. The SPGA must find that such extension, enlargement, renovation or alteration is not substantially more detrimental to the neighborhood than the existing nonconforming building. In making the finding that the enlargement, extension, renovation or alteration will not be substantially more detrimental, the SPGA may consider, without limitation, impacts upon the following: traffic volumes, traffic congestion, adequacy of municipal water supply and sewer capacity, noise, odor, scale, on-street parking, shading, visual effects and neighborhood character."

The proposal to perform renovations to the structure that will include a rear addition to construct an internal stairwell and a dormer will not impact the nonconforming dimensions. However, due to the full renovation of the three-family structures, these alterations to a nonconforming structure requires the Applicant to obtain special permits under §4.4.1 of the Somerville Zoning Ordinance (SZO).

Rear Structure

The rear structure is currently nonconforming with respect to the dimensional requirements for left side yard setback and right side yard setback.

The proposal will impact the nonconforming dimension of the left side yard setback. The current dimension is 7.5 feet and the proposal to construct an addition and dormer within the required setback will maintain the same distance. The requirement in the district is 8 feet for a 2.5 story structure. This alteration to a

nonconforming structure requires the Applicant to obtain special permits under §4.4.1 of the Somerville Zoning Ordinance (SZO).

Section 4.4.1 states that "[l]awfully existing one-and two-family dwellings which are only used as residences, which are nonconforming with respect to dimensional requirements, may be enlarged, extended, renovated or altered by special permit granted by the SPGA in accordance with the procedures of Article 5."

In considering a special permit under §4.4 of the SZO, the Board finds that the alterations and use proposed would not be substantially more detrimental to the neighborhood than the existing structure and use. The proposal will allow for modest improvements to the structure. The proposal has been designed with setbacks that minimally impact the neighbors and the requirements for lot area per dwelling unit, ground coverage, floor area ratio (FAR), building height, and rear yard setback will continue to be conforming to the requirements of the SZO.

Article 7: Table of Permitted Uses

SZO §7.11.1.c requires a Special Permit for the establishment of five residential units in the RC zoning district.

Article 9: Off-street Parking and Loading

		Existing		Proposed	
Unit #1	3 BR	2 spaces	3 BR	2 spaces	
Unit #2	3 BR	2 spaces	3 BR	2 spaces	
Unit #3	2 BR	1.5 spaces	2 BR	1.5 spaces	
Unit #4	5 BR	2 spaces	2 BR	1.5 spaces	
Unit #5			2 BR	1.5 spaces	
Total	8 spac	8 spaces (rounded up from 7.5) 9 spaces (rounded up from 8.5)		es (rounded up from 8.5)	

The site currently provides seven parking spaces for the four dwelling units. Therefore, the site is nonconforming with respect to the number of required off-street parking spaces as eight are currently required. For sites with a nonconforming number of parking spaces, SZO 9.4.2 only requires a proposal to provide the number of required spaces for what is being added to the site. The proposal is to add a second dwelling unit to the rear structure, which will increase the number of required parking spaces to nine. The proposal is to provide zero additional spaces on the site. SZO §9.13 allows for sites with nonconforming parking to apply for a Special Permit to modify parking requirements if the total number of spaces is six or fewer. Relief is being requested from providing the additional one required parking space.

In considering a special permit under §9.13 of the SZO "the SPGA may grant such a special permit only when consistent with the purposes set forth in Section 9.1, and upon reaching the findings and determinations set forth in Section 5.1.4". The Board finds that granting the requested Special Permit is consistent with the purposes of SZO §9.1 and will not cause detriment to increased traffic volumes, traffic congestion of queuing of vehicles, changes in the type of traffic, change in traffic patterns and access to the site, reduction in on-street parking, or unsafe conflicts of motor vehicles and pedestrian traffic.

3. <u>Consistency with Purposes:</u> The Applicant has to ensure that the project "is consistent with (1) the general purposes of this Ordinance as set forth in Article 1, and (2) the purposes, provisions, and specific objectives applicable to the requested special permit which may be set forth elsewhere in this Ordinance, such as, but not limited to, those purposes at the beginning of the various Articles."

The Board finds that the proposal is consistent with the general purposes of the Ordinance as set forth under §1.2, which includes, but is not limited to promote the health, safety, and welfare of the inhabitants of the City of Somerville; to protect health; to secure safety from fire, panic and other dangers; to provide adequate light and air; to conserve the value of land and buildings; to encourage the most appropriate use of land throughout the City; and to preserve and increase the amenities of the municipality.

The proposal is consistent with the purpose of the RC district, which is, "to establish and preserve a district for multi-family residential and other compatible uses which are of particular use and convenience to the residents of the district."

4. <u>Site and Area Compatibility:</u> The Applicant has to ensure that the project "(i)s designed in a manner that is compatible with the characteristics of the built and unbuilt surrounding area, including land uses."

The Board finds the proposal compatible with the surrounding area.

Surrounding Neighborhood: The subject property is located on the south side of Broadway on the block between Montgomery Avenue and Melvin Street opposite of Foss Park. This section of Broadway is primarily residential but includes a Dunkin', a barber's shop, and a gas station. The residential structures are primarily 2.5 stories.

Impacts of Proposal (Design and Compatibility): The proposed alterations will not have a noticeable impact from the public way. The alterations to the rear structure will not be visible from Broadway. The proposed dormer to the left side of the roof of the front structure will be visible from a small segment of the Broadway sidewalk. The extension of the roofs and rear stair additions will have no impact on both structure's design and compatibility with the neighborhood.

6. <u>Housing Impact:</u> Will not create adverse impacts on the stock of existing affordable housing.

The Board finds the proposal will not have an adverse impact.

7. <u>SomerVision Plan:</u> Complies with the applicable goals, policies and actions of the SomerVision plan, including the following, as appropriate: Preserve and enhance the character of Somerville's neighborhoods.

SomerVision Summary	Existing	Proposed
Dwelling Units:	4	5

The Board finds this proposal complies with SomerVision.

DECISION:

Present and sitting were Members Orsola Susan Fontano, Danielle Evans, Elaine Severino, Josh Safdie, Anne Brockelman, and Drew Kane. Upon making the above findings, Josh Safdie made a motion to approve the request for a Special Permit. Elaine Severino seconded the motion. Wherefore the Zoning Board of Appeals voted **5-0** to **approve** the request. In addition the following conditions were attached:

#	Condition		Timeframe for Compliance	Verified (initial)	Notes
1	Approval is for the alterations to both structures on the lot. This approval is based upon the following application materials and the plans submitted by the Applicant:		BP/CO	ISD/ Plng.	
	Date (Stamp Date)	Submission			
	October 23, 2019	Initial application submitted to the City Clerk's Office			
	October 24, 2019	Modified plans submitted to OSPCD (Z1.1, Z1.2, AE1.1-AE1.4, and AE2.1- AE2.5)			
	September 25, 2019	Existing conditions plan			
	Any changes to the approved site plan or elevations/use that are not <i>de minimis</i> must receive SPGA approval.				
Pre-	-Construction				
2	The Applicant must contact obtain a street address prior issued.	the Engineering Department to to a building permit being	BP	Eng.	
3	The proposed basement fini less than is 1 foot above the elevation. The seasonal high determined by a Massachus	shed floor elevation shall not be Seasonal High Ground Water In ground water elevation shall be etts certified soil evaluator and	BP	Eng.	
4	stated on a signed soil test pit log. The applicant must comply with the Policy for new connections to and modifications to existing connections to the municipal sewer and drainage system stormwater management and infiltration/inflow mitigation. The Applicant shall work with Engineering to meet this condition and provide the required fees/mitigation.		BP	Eng.	
Con	struction Impacts	Admired 1000/ mms garron.	<u> </u>	1	<u> </u>
5	The applicant shall post the	name and phone number of the entrance where it is visible to	During Construction	Plng.	
6	All construction materials and equipment must be stored onsite. If occupancy of the street layout is required, such occupancy must be in conformance with the requirements of the Manual on Uniform Traffic Control Devices and the prior approval of the Traffic and Parking Department must be obtained.		During Construction	T&P	
7	For the convenience of and during the construction phase begin prior to 7:30am and s Monday through Friday. The construction-related work p holidays.	respect for the neighborhood, se, construction work shall not hall finish no later than 5pm ere shall be no construction or erformed on weekends or	During Construction	ISD	
Desi	ign				

		•		
	Applicant shall provide final material samples for siding,	BP	Plng.	
8	trim, windows, and doors to Planning Staff for review and			
	approval prior to the issuance of a building permit. Siding			
	on both structures shall be fiber cement as presented at the			
Site	ZBA hearing.			
Site	Applicant shall submit an updated landscaping plan for	BP	Dlma	
	review and approval by Planning Staff showing removal of	BP	Plng.	
9	one exterior parking spot incorporated into landscaping and			
	pavers up to the back door of the house.			
	Landscaping shall be installed and maintained in	Perpetual	Plng. /	
10	compliance with the American Nurserymen's Association	Terpetuar	ISD ISD	
10	Standards;		1515	
Mis	cellaneous			
14113	Electrical conduits on the exterior facades of buildings shall	СО	Plng.	
	be painted to match the wall material to which they are		19.	
11	attached. Conduits are not allowed on the front of any			
	structure.			
		77	DI.	
	Garbage and recycling locations shall be clearly indicated	BP	Plng.	
12	on site plans. Storage areas shall be inside of the structure			
	or shall be fully screened from view from both the public			
12	way and abutters by an appropriate material reviewed and approved by staff. The location shall not impact any			
	parking, landscaping, or egress.			
	Granting of the applied for use or alteration does not include	Ongoing	ISD /	
1.2	the provision for short term rental uses, such as AirBnB,		Plng.	
13	VRBO, or the like. Separate approvals are needed for the			
	aforementioned uses.			
	The Applicant, its successors and/or assigns, shall be	Cont.	ISD	
	responsible for maintenance of both the building and all on-			
14	site amenities, including landscaping, fencing, lighting,			
	parking areas and storm water systems, ensuring they are			
	clean, well kept and in good and safe working order.			
Pub	lic Safety			
15	The Applicant or Owner shall meet the Fire Prevention	CO	FP	
13	Bureau's requirements.			
1.0	Per Somerville fire safety regulations, grills, barbecues,	Perpetual	FP/ISD	
16	chimineas and the like are NOT permitted on decks or			
	porches.		DI	
17	To the extent possible, all exterior lighting must be confined	CO	Plng.	
	to the subject property, cast light downward and must not			
т.	intrude, interfere or spill onto neighboring properties.			
Fina	al Sign-Off	Final size	Dine	
18	The Applicant shall contact Planning Staff at least five	Final sign	Plng.	
	working days in advance of a request for a final inspection	off		
	by Inspectional Services to ensure the proposal was constructed in accordance with the plans and information			
	submitted and the conditions attached to this approval.			
	submitted and the conditions attached to this approval.			

Attest, by the Zoning Board of Appeals:	Orsola Susan Fontano, Chairman Danielle Evans, Clerk Anne Brockelman Elaine Severino Josh Safdie Drew Kane, Alternate
Attest, by the Planner:	
Melissa A. Woods	
Copies of this decision are filed in the Somerville City Clerk's office. Copies of all plans referred to in this decision and a detailed record of the SPGA proceedings are filed in the Somerville Planning Dept.	
CLERK'S CERTIFICATE	
Any appeal of this decision must be filed within twenty day City Clerk, and must be filed in accordance with M.G.L. c. 40	
In accordance with M.G.L. c. 40 A, sec. 11, no variance sh certification of the City Clerk that twenty days have elapsed a Clerk and no appeal has been filed, or that if such appeal h recorded in the Middlesex County Registry of Deeds and ind of record or is recorded and noted on the owner's certificate of	fter the decision has been filed in the Office of the City has been filed, that it has been dismissed or denied, is exed in the grantor index under the name of the owner
Also in accordance with M.G.L. c. 40 A, sec. 11, a special pearing the certification of the City Clerk that twenty days Office of the City Clerk and either that no appeal has been recorded in the Middlesex County Registry of Deeds and independent of the City Clerk and either that no appeal has been recorded in the Middlesex County Registry of Deeds and independent of the City Clerk and either that no appeal has been recorded in the Middlesex County Registry of Deeds and independent of the City Clerk and either that no appeal has been recorded in the Middlesex County Registry of Deeds and independent of the City Clerk and either that no appeal has been recorded in the Middlesex County Registry of Deeds and independent of the City Clerk and either that no appeal has been recorded in the Middlesex County Registry of Deeds and independent of the City Clerk and either that no appeal has been recorded in the Middlesex County Registry of Deeds and independent of the City Clerk and either that no appeal has been recorded in the Middlesex County Registry of Deeds and independent of the City Clerk and either that no appeal has been recorded in the Middlesex County Registry of Deeds and independent of the City Clerk and either that no appeal has been recorded in the Middlesex County Registry of Deeds and independent of the City Clerk and either that no appeal has been recorded in the City Clerk and either that no appeal has been recorded in the City Clerk and either that no appeal has been recorded in the City Clerk and either that no appeal has been recorded in the City Clerk and either that no appeal has been recorded in the City Clerk and either that no appeal has been recorded in the City Clerk and either that no appeal has been recorded in the City Clerk and either that no appeal has been recorded in the City Clerk and either that no appeal has been recorded in the City Clerk and either that no appeal has been recorded in the City Clerk and either that no appeal has been recorded in the City Clerk and either that no	have elapsed after the decision has been filed in the filed or the appeal has been filed within such time, is

of record or is recorded and noted on the owner's certificate of title. The person exercising rights under a duly appealed Special Permit does so at risk that a court will reverse the permit and that any construction performed

The owner or applicant shall pay the fee for recording or registering. Furthermore, a permit from the Division of Inspectional Services shall be required in order to proceed with any project favorably decided upon by this decision, and upon request, the Applicant shall present evidence to the Building Official that this decision is properly

under the permit may be ordered undone.

recorded.

City Clerk Date